Lauryn Woodruff, Michelle Snow, Daniele G. Kuhn

Diet Quality, Immunity, and Body Composition Among UMD Vegetarian and Non-Vegetarian Students

Study Rationale

- A vegetarian diet can be advantageous
- College students are at risk for initiating over-restrictive vegetarian and other diets (influence from marketing, social media "influencers", etc.)
- Students may pursue vegetarianism for reasons such as weight loss, environmental activism or animal protection
- Educating young adults about how to properly execute a healthful, balanced vegetarian diet may be necessary to avoid the development of disordered eating patterns and nutritional deficiencies
- *Knowing the benefits of a balanced vegetarian diet stimulated the question of whether vegetarian college students get sick less often and are healthier than non-vegetarian college students.*

Research Question/Hypothesis

This study aimed to evaluate the health and immune status

of University of Maryland *vegetarian* VS *non-vegetarian students* by surveying <u>frequency of illness</u> over the past year as well as <u>body composition</u> and <u>vegetable/fruit intake</u> in

order to determine *which groups* had **better immune**

function and overall health.



Study Justification

- Studies are conducted on the overall health benefits of vegetarian diets
- Studies on Pediatric diets and immunoglobulins were found but not for adults
- Few studies were found of the relationship between a vegetarian diet and frequency of illness (cold/flu) in the college age population
- We chose to analyze diet quality by vegetable and fruit intake in order to gauge the presence of antioxidants and Vitamin-C containing foods that fight illness and can improve health of both vegetarians and non-vegetarians.

Clin Pediatr (Phila), 2013 Mar;52(3):241-6. doi: 10.1177/0009922812472250. Epub 2013 Jan 24.

Impact of vegetarian diet on serum immunoglobulin levels in children.

Gorczyca D¹, Prescha A, Szeremeta K.

Author information

3rd Department and Clinic of Paediatrics, Immunology and Rheumaology of Developmental Age, Wrocław Medical University, 51-149 Wrocław, Poland. daiva.gorczyca@a.m.wroc.pl

Abstract

BACKGROUND: Nutrition plays an important role in immune response. We evaluated the effect of nutrient intake on serum immunoglobulin levels in vegetarian and omnivore children.

METHODS: Serum immunoglobulin levels and iron status were estimated in 22 vegetarian and 18 omnivore children. Seven-day food record were used to assess the diet.

RESULTS: There were no significant differences in serum IqA, IgM, and IgG levels between groups of children. Serum immunoglobulin level were lower in vegetarian children with iron deficiency in comparison with those without iron deficiency. In the vegetarians, IgG level correlate positively with energy, zinc, copper, and vitamin B(6) intake. In the omnivores, these correlations were stronger with IgM level.

CONCLUSIONS: Despite negligible differences in serum immunoglobulin levels between vegetarian and omnivore children, the impact of several nutrient intakes on IgM and IgG levels differed between groups. Low iron status in vegetarian children can lead to decreased immunoglobulin levels.

Participants

- University of Maryland College Park Students
- 18-29 years of age
- N=15 (1 was excluded as outlier)
 - 10 females
 - 5 males
- Vegetarian/Vegan and Non-vegetarian
 - 9 vegetarian/ vegan
 - 7 females/2 males
 - 6 non-vegetarians
 - 3 females/3 males
- Excluded smokers, parents, and immunocompromised students





Recruiting Materials Used









Methods

- 1. Students were recruited on a Friday afternoon at/around McKeldin Library
- 2. Students brought to "study room" & filled out consent form
- 3. NCI (NIH) by Meal <u>Fruit & Vegetable Screener</u>
- 4. Participant surveys & consent form marked with a number for confidentiality
- 5. Participants were given a quick explanation of the Tanita scale and asked to remove: shoes, socks, metal, and electronic watches.
- 6. Tanita scale measurements taken:
 - a. Height
 - b. Weight
 - c. Body fat %
- 7. Data input into Excel spreadsheet
- 8. A \$20 Target gift card raffle was used to generate interest



Consent Form

age 1 of	University of Maryland College Park hitions Date	Page 2 of	University of Maryland College Park Initials Date				
Project Title	Diet Quality, Immunity, and Body Composition Among UMD Vegetarian and Non-Vecedarian Students		If you decide to stop taking part in the study, if you have questions, concerns, or complaints, or if you need to report an injury related to the research please contact one of the investigators:				
Purpose of the Study	This research is being conducted by Michelle Snow, Lauryn Woodruff, and Daniele Kuhn at the University of Maryland, College Park. We are inviting you to participate in this research project because you are a male or female, aged 20 to 29 years and aro other a vogatarian or onnivore. The purpose of this research project is to assess and compare the usual fruit and vegetable intakes of vegetarian and non-vegetarian students at the University of Maryland. This data will be compared to average overall rates of self-reported linesses to measure limmunity.		Michelle Snow Oll2 Skinner Building University of Maryland College Park, MD 20742 757-705-6005 michelemsnow@gmail.com				
Procedures	The procedures involve filling out an Immunity Questionnaire, Diet Questionnaire, and this consent form. We will also measure your body composition using the Tania Scale.		818-723-4711 Icwoodruff1001@gmuil.com				
Potential Risks and Discomforts	There are no risks from participating in this research study.		Daniele Grandmalson Kuhn 301-312-5305				
Potential Benefits	There are no direct benefits to participants. However, possible benefits include helping students think of the correlation between diet and immunity, as well as potentially making them aware of the types of diets there are.	Participant Rights	anrelexunnagmain.com If you have questions about your rights as a research participant or wish to report a research-related injury, please contact: University of Maryland College Park Institutional Review Board Office 1204 Marrie Mount Val742 E-mail: Instant, adv142 E-mail: Instant, edv1 Telephone: 301-405-0678 This research has been review ed according to the University of Maryland, College Park IRB procedures for research involving				
Confidentiality	The surveys are anonymous and will not contain information that may personally identify you. If we write a report or article about this research project, your identify will be protected to the maximum extent possible. Your information may be shared with representatives of the University of Manyland, College Park or governmental suthorities if you or someone else is in danger or if we are required to do so by law.						
Medical Treatment	The University of Maryland does not provide any medical, hospitalization or other insurance for participants in this research study, nor will the University of Maryland provide any medical freatment or compensation for any injury sustained as a musul of participation in this research study, except as required by law.	Statement of Consent	human subjects. Your signature indicates that you are at least 18 years of age; you have read this consent form or have had it read to you; your questions have been answered to your satisfaction and you voluntarily agree to participate in this research study. You will receive a copy of this signed consent form.				
and Questions	choose not to take part at all. If you decide to participate in this research, you may stop participating at any time. If you decide not		If you agree to participate, please sign your name below.				
	to participate in this study or if you stop participating at any time, you will not be penalized or lose any benefits to which you otherwise qualify.	Signature and Date	NAME OF SUBJECT [Please Print] SIGNATURE OF SUBJECT				
	If you are an employee or student, your employment status or academic standing at UMD will not be affected by your participation as the property of the study.		DATE				

Immunity Questionnaire

Immunity Status Questionnaire

Scree The f our st is col	ning Questions oliowing questions will be used to determine if the udy. Please answer the questions honestly and to lected and stored anonymously.	data you provide today can be included in the best of your ability. All data provided
1	Are you an undergraduate student currently attending the University of Maryland (College Park)?	Yes 🗆 No 🗆
2	What is your age?	years old
3	What gender do you identify as?	Female Male
4	Are you currently following a vegetarian or vegan diet? (If no, skip to question 7)	Yes 🗆 No 🗆
5	If you answered yes to the above question, please check the type of diet that most closely applies to you.	□ Lacto-vegetarian excludes meet, fish, poulity and eggs, as well as foods that contain them. Dairy products, such as milk, cheese, yogurt and butter, are included
		Ovo-vegetarian excludes meat, poultry, seafood and dairy products, but eats eggs
		Lacto-ovo vegetarian excludes meat, fish and poultry, but eats dairy products and eggs
		Pescatarian excludes meat and poultry, dairy, and eggs, but cats fish.
		Vegan excludes meat, poultry, fish, egg and dairy products — and other foods that contain these products U.L.
		- Hala
6	How long have you been following this diet? (Skip this question if you checked no to question 4)	Less than 6 months At least 6 months but less than 1 year Over one year
7	Do you smoke?	Yes D

8	Do you currently work or volunteer in a	Yes						
110.000	nospital, clinic, or school environment?	Var						
9	Do you take immune suppressing drugs?	Yes						
623	, , , , ,	No						
10	Are you a nutrition studies major (Example:	Yes 🗆						
10	Dietetics, Food Science, etc)	No 🗆						
11	Are you a parent of school-aged children?	Yes 🗆						
	File you a patent of school-aged enhorem	No 🗆						
Healt	h Status							
Please	answer the following questions to the best of your	memory and knowledge.						
12	Over the past year, how many times have you been sick with a respiratory infection, common cold or the flu, with any of the following symptoms not related to seasonal allergies: Congestion Fever Sore throat Cough							
13	Over the past year, how many times has a sickness (as defined in the previous question) resulted in taking over the counter cold or flu medications?							
14	Over the past year, how many times has a sickness (as defined in the previous question) resulted in a visit to an urgent care center, hospital, or a primary care doctor?	·						
	Han and share the second with some infl	Yes 🗌						
	Have you ever been diagnosed with sepsis?	No 🗆						
		Yes 🗆						
	Did you take the flu shot over the past year?	No						

Immunity Status Questionnaire

We developed a survey to gather information about frequency of illness, gender, age, and type of diet consumed.

<u>Flaws</u>

- We did not formulate questions clearly enough
- We wanted to exclude participants who worked with young children so we included a question asking if they worked in a "hospital, clinic, or school environment". Later we realized that they were checking yes because they worked at UMD
- Not validated
- Relied heavily on subjective memory

National Cancer Institute - Eating at America's Table Quick Food Scan



Fruit & Vegetable Food Frequency Questionnaire

We used the Fruit and Vegetable Screener from the National Cancer Institute (NCI).

Benefits of using this survey:

- Better at measuring usual intake
- Short only 28 total questions asking frequency and serving sizes of fruits and vegetables
- Validated method
 - Used the newer "By-Meal" Screener which is slightly more accurate than All Day Screener
 - While underestimates true intake as compared to 24 hour recall, considered appropriate for evaluating groups



Flaws in our method:

- Serving sizes may be inaccurate because we did not provide reference serving cups for the participants
- Reliability of memory over past month
- Under and Over-reporting of intake
 - Subject #9 reported 22 servings of combined fruit/veg yet weighed <100 lbs and BMI was underweight
 - "Individual attitudes about body weight strongly influenced reported intake, even if asked to report usual food intake during the previous year" (Johansson, et al, 1998)
- Relies on memory over past month

Scoring the Screener

No tool easily available to score the screener

Developed a tool from scratch in Excel using drop down lists, formulas and macros

Daily servings of fruit and vegetable is automatically calculated

AutoSave 💽 🛱 🦻 Y 🗸 🗟 🗸									FFQ_Scoring_Final - Excel							Michel	le Snow			
File Home Insert Page Layout Formulas Data Review View Developer Help Acrobat 🔎 Search																				
RESET	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20
1	Never	1-3	Never	▼ 1-2	1-3	1-3	1-2	3	1-2	3-4	Never	Never	1-3	Never	1					
	0	0.067	(100	% fruit juice	2).067	0.214	3	0.214	0.5	0	0	0.067	0	1					
1a		А	Nev	er		С	В	С	С	В			В		В					
	0	0.5	1-3 times last month			625	1	1.625	1.625	1	0	0	1	0	1					
Fruit	0	0.0335	3-4 times per week 5-6 times per week			10888	0.214	4.875	0.34775	0.5	0	0	0.067	0	1	-	-	-	-	-
2	1-3	1-3				1-2	1-2	1-2	1	5-6	1-3	1-3	2	1-2	3-4					
	0.067	0.067	0.2 1 tin	ne per day		0.214	0.214	0.214	1	0.786	0.067	0.067	2	0.214	0.5					
2a	В	А	E 2 tin	nes per day		В	В	В	С	А	С	D	В	В	В					
	.5	.25	- 4 tin	nes per day		.5	.5	.5	1	.25	1	1.5	.5	.5	.5					
Veg	0.0335	0.01675	0.1 5 or	more times	ner dav).107	0.107	0.107	1	0.1965	0.067	0.1005	1	0.107	0.25	-			-	-
3	1-3	1-2	1-3	1-2	1-2	1-3	3-4	1-2	Never	1-3	1-2	1-3	1-3	Never	1-3					
	0.067	0.214	0.067	0.214	0.214	0.067	0.5	0.214	0	0.067	0.214	0.067	0.067	0	0.067					
3a	A	A	В	В	C	В	В	В		A	В	В	A		A					
	.2	.2	.5	.5	.75	.5	.5	.5	0	.2	.5	.5	.2	0	.2					
Veg	0.0134	0.0428	0.0335	0.107	0.1605	0.0335	0.25	0.107	0	0.0134	0.107	0.0335	0.0134	0	0.0134	-			-	-
4	Never	Never	1-2	1-3	1-2	1-2	1-2	3	Never	1-3	1-2	1-2	1-2	1-3	1-3					
	0	0	0.214	0.067	0.214	0.214	0.214	3	0	0.067	0.214	0.214	0.214	0.067	0.067				-	
4a			A	В	В	C	С	С		В	C	В	A	В	A					
	0	0	.25	.75	.75	1.2	1.2	1.2	0	.75	1.2	.75	.25	.75	.25					
Veg	0	0	0.0535	0.05025	0.1605	0.2568	0.2568	3.6	0	0.05025	0.2568	0.1605	0.0535	0.05025	0.01675	-			-	-
5	1	1-3	Never	1-3	Never	1-2	3-4	2	3-4	1-3	3-4	1-2	3-4	1-2	1-3					
	1	0.067	0	0.067	0	0.214	0.5	2	0.5	0.067	0.5	0.214	0.5	0.214	0.067				-	_
за	75	A	0	75	0	1.25	1.25	1.25	1.25	75	75	D 75	75	75	75				_	
Ver	./5	.25	0	./5	0	0.2675	0.625	2.25	0.625	./5	./5	./5	./5	./5	./5					
veg 6	0.75	Novor	01/07/	1.2	Novor	1.2	3.4	1.2	2.4	5.6	5.6	1.2	2.4	2.4	0.03023					
	1	0	1	0.214	0	0.214	0.5	0.214	0.5	0.786	0.786	0.214	0.5	0.5	every 1					
6a	C C		C C	R		R	R	R	R	D.700	0.700	R	R	R	R					
	1	0	1	.5	0	.5	.5	.5	.5	1.5	1	.5	.5	.5	.5					
Fruit	1	0	1	0.107	0	0.107	0.25	0.107	0.25	1,179	0.786	0.107	0.25	0.25	0.5	-	-	-	-	-
7	5-6	Never	1-3	Never	Never	1-3	1-2	3-4	3-4	1-3	1-2	1-3	Never	Never	1-2					
	0.786	0	0.067	0	0	0.067	0.214	0.5	0.5	0.067	0.214	0.067	0	0	0.214					
7a	A		A			В	В	С	В	В	В	В			А					
	.25	0	.25	0	0	.75	.75	1.5	.75	.75	.75	.75	0	0	.25					
Vor	0 1000		0.01670	^	0	0.05025	0 1605	0.75	0.275	0.05025	0 1605	0.05025	0	0	0.0020					
	NCLE	uit & veg	screener	(+)											4					
and a second sec																				1444

Results

Mean Intakes

Vegetarians 6.39 cups Veg (excluding outlier) 4.42 cups Non vegetarians 2.09 cups

P-value of 0.006 → Significant difference in intake between groups even after excluding outlier

Comparing Fruit and Vegetable Intakes of Vegetarians vs Non-Vegetarians



Immunity Results

Mean Frequencies of Illness

Vegetarian

1.94 times

Non-vegetarian

2.23 times

P-value of 0.678 \rightarrow

No significant difference between groups



Anthropometric Results



<u>Non-veg</u> 27.87

Conclusion

- On average, vegetarians were found to have lower fat percentages and decreased BMI.
- Consumption of fruits and vegetables was higher in vegetarian students at 4.42 servings versus non-vegetarians at 2.09 servings with p-value 0.006. Excel was used to perform a two-tailed T-Test.
- Rates of illness were lower in vegetarians at 1.9 times over the past year versus 2.3 for non-vegetarians with a p-value of 0.678, which lacked statistical significance.
- We found that University of Maryland <u>students following vegetarian diets had</u> <u>increased diet quality</u> but there is not enough data to correlate this with better immunity outcomes.

Discussion

- While there was a <u>statistical significant difference in intakes of vegetables and</u> <u>fruits for vegetarians</u>, we weren't able to get conclusive results about differences in immunity status.
- This could be due to our small sample size, or to the way we measured illness. A blood test measuring biomarkers of immune status may be more indicative of true immune status.
- However, we did confirm that having a vegetarian/vegan diet allowed for adequate fruit & vegetable consumption in line with the 2015 dietary guidelines.
 - 2015-2020 Guidelines: 4 ¹/₂ cups of fruits/vegetables (2 ¹/₂ Vegetable and 2 Fruit)
 - Non-veg: 2.09 cups veg/fruit (1.73/0.35) Veg: 4.42 cups veg/fruit (3.25/1.17)

Study Limits



- Small sample size
- Inaccuracies of Tanita scale
- Measurements not taken after fasting or
 - other restrictions (exercise, caffeine, etc.)
- Could not collect biochemical data
- Participants may have over or underreported intakes
- Illness frequency was self-reported and may not have been accurate
- Only evaluated fruit and vegetable intake, not a full dietary analysis

References

- Clarys, P., Deliens, T., Huybrechts, I., Deriemaeker, P., Vanaelst, B., De Keyzer, W., ... Mullie, P. (2014). Comparison of Nutritional Quality of the Vegan, Vegetarian, Semi-Vegetarian, Pesco-Vegetarian and Omnivorous Diet. Nutrients, 6(3), 1318–1332. https://doi.org/10.3390/nu6031318
- (2) Craig, W. J. (2009). Health effects of vegan diets. The American Journal of Clinical Nutrition, 89(5), 1627S-1633S. https://doi.org/10.3945/ajcn.2009.26736N
- (3) Craig, W. J. (2010). Nutrition Concerns and Health Effects of Vegetarian Diets. Nutrition in Clinical Practice, 25(6), 613–620. https://doi.org/10.1177/0884533610385707
- Gorczyca, D., Prescha, A., & Szeremeta, K. (2013). Impact of Vegetarian Diet on Serum Immunoglobulin Levels in Children. Clinical Pediatrics, 52(3), 241–246. https://doi.org/10.1177/0009922812472250
- (5) Haddad EH, Berk LS, Kettering JD, Hubbard RW, Peters WR. Dietary intake and biochemical, hematologic, and immune status of vegans compared with nonvegetarians. The American Journal of Clinical Nutrition. 1999;70(3):586s-593s. doi:10.1093/ajcn/70.3.586s
- (6) Johansson L, Solvoll K, Bjørneboe GEA, Drevon CA. Under- and overreporting of energy intake related to weight status and lifestyle in a nationwide sample. Am J Clin Nutr. 1998;68:266–74.
- (7) Orlich, M. J., Singh, P. N., Sabaté, J., Jaceldo-Siegl, K., Fan, J., Knutsen, S., ... Fraser, G. E. (2013). Vegetarian Dietary Patterns and Mortality in Adventist Health Study 2. JAMA Internal Medicine, 173(13), 1230–1238. <u>https://doi.org/10.1001/jamainternmed.2013.6473</u>
- (8) Thompson FE, Subar AF, Smith AF, et al. Fruit and vegetable assessment: performance of 2 new short instruments and a food frequency questionnaire. J Am Diet Assoc. 2002;102(12):1764-1772. doi:10.1016/s0002-8223(02)90379-2
- (9) Traynor, M. M., Holowaty, P. H., Reid, D. J., & Gray-Donald, K. (2006). Vegetable and fruit food frequency questionnaire serves as a proxy for quantified intake. Canadian Journal of Public Health = Revue Canadienne De Sante Publique, 97(4), 286–290.
- (10) Yaroch, A. L., Tooze, J., Thompson, F. E., Blanck, H. M., Thompson, O. M., Colón-Ramos, U., ... Nebeling, L. C. (2012). Evaluation of three short dietary instruments to assess fruit and vegetable intake: The National Cancer Institute's Food Attitudes and Behaviors (FAB) Survey. Journal of the Academy of Nutrition and Dietetics, 112(10), 1570–1577. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jand.2012.06.002
- (11) Zhang, C., Björkman, A., Cai, K., Liu, G., Wang, C., Li, Y., ... Pan-Hammarström, Q. (2018). Impact of a 3-Months Vegetarian Diet on the Gut Microbiota and Immune Repertoire. Frontiers in Immunology, 9. https://doi.org/10.3389/fimmu.2018.00908 Foods Containing Phytochemicals. Breastcancer.org. https://www.breastcancer.org/tips/nutrition/reduce_risk/foods/phytochem. Published February 5, 2015. Accessed October 23, 2019.